This page intentionally left blank
BIOETHICS IN SINGAPORE
The Ethical Microcosm
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Lim Pin</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editors’ Note and Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Contributors</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Coming of Bioethics to Singapore</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>W Calvin Ho and Sylvia SN Lim</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Impact of the Bioethics Advisory Committee on the Research Community in Singapore</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Charmaine KM Chan and Edison T Liu</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engaging the Public: The Role of the Media</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Chang Ai-Lien and Judith Tan</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confucian Trust and the Biomedical Regulatory Framework in Singapore</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Anh Tuan Nuyen</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Clinician-Researcher: A Servant of Two Masters?</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Alastair V Campbell, Jacqueline Chin and Teck Chuan Voo</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

The US Model for Oversight of Human Stem Cell Research 109
Lindsay Parham and Bernard Lo

Genetics and Stem Cell Research: Models of International Policy-making 133
Bartha Maria Knoppers, Emily Kirby and Rosario Isasi

Public Engagement and Bioethics Commissions 165
Thomas H Murray and Ross S White

Norm-making on Human-Animal Chimeras and Hybrids in Singapore, the United Kingdom and the International Domain 187
W Calvin Ho and Martin Bobrow

How Will Future Bioethical Issues Engage Singapore? 235
John Elliott

Annex A: Members of the Bioethics Advisory Committee and its Sub-Committees and Working Group 261

Annex B: Members of the International Panel of Experts 267

Annex C: Reports of the Bioethics Advisory Committee 269

Annex D: A Decade of Events that Shaped Bioethics in Singapore 271

References 303

Index 323
Foreword

In December 2000, the Singapore Government established the Bioethics Advisory Committee (BAC). The BAC had the wide remit of investigating and recommending on the ethical, legal, and social issues surrounding the field of biomedical sciences research in Singapore. In the subsequent decade, the Committee investigated a number of pressing matters, starting with the sometimes vexed issue of stem cell research, and its recommendations have been the basis for securing the ethical foundations of burgeoning biomedical research in Singapore.

While the immediate work of the BAC was to recommend an ethical governance framework to regulate this development, this could not be done without an in-depth consideration of issues in a wider context. This book is the product of these considerations. It tries to put the work of the BAC into a broader cultural, social, and ethical context. It is not just a celebratory account of ten years of work, nor is it entirely retrospective in focus, nor is it about Singapore alone. Some chapters are relatively local in their context, but others are strongly international. Almost all of the authors have direct experience in the work of the BAC, and their chapters provide an in-depth account of aspects of their expertise that have impacted the BAC and helped to set it in perspective.

It is worth reiterating that the BAC remit refers to “ethical, legal, and social issues”. The first three chapters address such issues from three very different perspectives. In the first two chapters, the respective authors have conducted extensive interviews with BAC members (past and present) and with researchers and research administrators. These yield interesting reflections on the role and impact of the BAC. One clear conclusion from these chapters is that as Singapore moves forward the BAC will need to adapt its modus
operandi to changes in the character of society, and that changes to the consultation process will need to be a part of this. The third chapter is an unusual one in looking at the work of the BAC and how it engages the public from the perspective of working journalists.

These first three chapters all highlight aspects of the BAC that reflect its Asian character, which shows in its style and non-confrontational approach. The fourth chapter offers an explicit philosophical discussion of Confucian ethics, and what it means for the biomedical framework in Singapore. This chapter will be of great interest to ethicists and moral philosophers keen on considering the extent to which ethical principles diverge as a function of culture and history. This and the remaining chapters in the book move increasingly into the details of specific ethical topics.

Chapter 5 by Campbell et al. explores the inherent tensions when the roles of researcher and clinician are combined in a single individual. Chapter 6 by Parham and Lo takes the reader to the United States, where Bernard Lo has been at the forefront of regulatory issues in stem cell research ethics. He and his co-author provide a thorough review of the field which they then helpfully link to the development of regulation in Singapore. Chapter 7 by Knoppers et al. also deals with genetics and stem cell research, but their focus is on international policy-making. Their review of this topic offers a comprehensive historical account of the major pre- and post-genomic era regulatory developments and they also consider the Canadian and Singapore situations in some detail.

Chapter 8 by Murray and White of the Hastings Center provides an insightful comparison of the ways in which the National Bioethics Advisory Commission (NBAC) in the United States and the BAC addressed the subject of using human biological materials in research. Established in 1996, the NBAC served as the national bioethics advisory body to the Clinton Administration until 2001. Tom Murray was a former Commissioner on the NBAC, hence his views on the subject are especially pertinent. Murray and White further propose a novel four-stage process in thinking about public engagement on bioethical issues.

Chapter 9 by Ho and Bobrow is an interesting venture into the various kinds of human-animal combinations that have been the subject of recent legislation in the UK, and are currently on the horizon in Singapore. Here,
as in other chapters, it is evident that an effort at globalising bioethics does not entail downplaying context and culture; it tends rather to highlight them. In the final chapter, Elliott takes a speculative look at possible future developments and how the BAC may react to them. He concludes that a future emphasis may have to be more explicitly on the need to consider the wider impact of research activities, in order to bring them into some kind of a sustainable balance in the long run. The four annexes at the end of the book provide general information on past and present members of the BAC, its International Panel of Experts, its reports, and key scientific and bioethics events in Singapore and abroad.

Singapore is indeed an ethical microcosm. It is also a legal and social microcosm. Running through all the chapters is a palpable sense that while we have arrived at a destination, having achieved a foundation for an agenda of biomedical research, we have also arrived at a departure point. The directions for the future are only now becoming apparent with the emergence of technologies and knowledge that can potentially transform society by transforming people.

Lim Pin
Chairman
Bioethics Advisory Committee
Singapore
Editors’ Note and Acknowledgements

The idea of producing a book about the Bioethics Advisory Committee (BAC) and its work almost a decade after its establishment was conceived as early as 2007. The intention was both to review the development of bioethics in Singapore and to consider what comparative value this may have for a wider readership. The ethical governance of rapid scientific change raises issues internationally and not in Singapore alone.

While we have tried to provide a retrospective appraisal of the contribution of the BAC, our main objective is to make a wider substantive contribution to the rapidly emerging field of bioethics. To that end the book includes original contributions from a number of distinguished writers and researchers in ethics, philosophy, law, and the biomedical and social sciences, all of whom have been closely involved in the institutionalisation of bioethics in Singapore. In many chapters there are also contributions from a younger generation of scholars and researchers interested in the field of bioethics.

Although many of the contributors to this book are closely connected to the BAC, this book is not an official account. All opinions and views expressed are personal to the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of the BAC or any other organisation. All links to Internet websites stated in this book have been verified to be correct and active as of 7 June 2010.

We are honoured to have had the opportunity to work with our contributors and thank them for their insights and also their efforts to meet tight deadlines. We are grateful to Professor Lim Pin, Chairman of the BAC, for supporting the effort to frame the work as an original contribution to the field, and for kindly providing the Foreword. In addition, we are grateful to past and present members of the BAC, as well as to many individuals (not all of whom could be explicitly acknowledged here) who have generously supported this project.
Editors' Note and Acknowledgements

through the sharing of their views, knowledge, and experiences in interviews, discussions, and records. This project would not have been possible without their help. We would also like to thank our editor at World Scientific, Lim Sook Cheng, for her patience with this project, and Siah Rouh Phin of the NUS Office of Legal Affairs, for her support. Our colleagues, Victoria Ang and Charmaine Chan, provided us with crucial editorial assistance, for which we are also grateful. Finally, we are indebted to our families for their support.

The editing of this book has been a sustained collective and collaborative effort, and none of us claims any priority. The editors listed here and on the title page are in alphabetical order by family name.

John M Elliott,
W Calvin Ho &
Sylvia SN Lim
Notes on Contributors

Martin BOBROW, CBE, FRS, FMedSci, is Emeritus Professor of Medical Genetics at Cambridge University and has been an advisor to Singapore’s Bioethics Advisory Committee (BAC) since 2001. He was Chair of a UK Academy of Medical Sciences Working Group that was responsible for the report *Inter-species Embryos* (June 2007). He is currently the Chair of another Working Group of the Academy that is examining the use of animals containing human material in scientific research.

Alastair V CAMPBELL, MA, BD, ThD, is the Chen Su Lan Centennial Professor of Medical Ethics and Director of the Centre for Biomedical Ethics in the Yong Loo Lin School of Medicine at the National University of Singapore (NUS). His recent books include *Health as Liberation* (1996), *Medical Ethics* (with DG Jones and G Gillett, 4th Edition, 2005), and *The Body in Bioethics* (2009). He is currently a member of the BAC, and a Board Member of the Singapore Health Sciences Authority and of the National Medical Research Council.

Charmaine KM CHAN, BSc (Hons), graduated from NUS in 2008 with a degree in Life Sciences (specialisation in Biomedical Science). She is currently with the Secretariat of the BAC.

CHANG Ai-Lien, BA, is a Senior Correspondent with the *Straits Times*. She has been a journalist for 16 years, and specialises in reporting on science in Singapore. She is a member of the Genetic Modification Advisory Committee (sub-committee on public awareness) — an expert panel which makes decisions on genetically modified foods, and is part of the Concepts Committee shaping the development of the new Science Centre Singapore. She is also a board member of the Singapore Mental Health Study, a landmark project looking at the state of mental illness in the Republic, and an advisory board member of the NUS’s science communication programmes.
Notes on Contributors

Jacqueline CHIN, BPhil, DPhil, is Assistant Professor at the Centre for Biomedical Ethics, NUS, and jointly appointed to the Department of Philosophy. She is a member of the National Transplant Ethics Panel of Laypersons and the National Medical Ethics Committee Workgroup for Advance Care Planning, and Co-Director of the Singapore Ministry of Health-funded CENTRES project for research and support of the work of clinical ethics committees in public and private sector hospitals.

John ELLIOTT, PhD, is a citizen of Singapore and an Associate Professorial Fellow in the Department of Psychology, NUS, where he has researched and taught since 1986. He is a past member of the BAC, the Singapore National Medical Ethics Committee, and the Panel of Advisors to the Juvenile Court, and is currently with the BAC Secretariat.

W Calvin HO, MS (Econ), LLM, is senior research associate with the Secretariat of the BAC. He is also a doctoral candidate at Cornell University and a visiting Fellow at Cambridge University.

Rosario ISASI, JD, MPH, is a Research Associate at the Centre of Genomics and Policy, Faculty of Medicine, Department of Human Genetics at McGill University. Her research interests intersect public health, ethics, law, and science. She has particular expertise in the area of comparative law and international governance issues surrounding regenerative medicine and stem cell research. She has published in Science, Human Reproduction, Cell Stem Cell, Stem Cell Research, American Journal of Law and Medicine, Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics, amongst other journals.

Emily KIRBY, BSc, is a research assistant at the Centre of Genomics and Policy (McGill University) and is currently completing her Bachelor of Civil Law degree at the University of Montreal.

Bartha Maria KNOPPERS, PhD, is Professor of Law and Bioethics in the Faculty of Medicine (Department of Genetics) and Director of the Centre of Genomics and Policy, McGill University. She is an international expert on genomics and policymaking, Chair of the Ethics Working Party of the International Stem Cell Forum, and Officer of the Order of Canada. She is also an advisor to the BAC.